# BY SCOTT C. DONEY, WILLIAM M. BALCH, VICTORIA J. FABRY, AND RICHARD A. FEELY

# **OCEAN ACIDIFICATION**



# A CRITICAL EMERGING PROBLEM FOR THE OCEAN SCIENCES

#### ABSTRACT

Over a period of less than a decade, ocean acidification—the change in seawater chemistry due to rising atmospheric carbon dioxide  $(CO_2)$  levels and subsequent impacts on marine life—has become one of the most critical and pressing issues facing the ocean research community and marine resource managers alike. The objective of this special issue of *Oceanography* is to provide an overview of the current scientific understanding of ocean acidification as well as to indicate the substantial gaps in our present knowledge. Papers in the special issue discuss the past, current, and future trends in seawater chemistry; highlight potential vulnerabilities to marine species, ecosystems, and marine resources to elevated  $CO_2$ ; and outline a roadmap toward future research directions. In this introductory article, we present a brief introduction on ocean acidification and some historical context for how it emerged so quickly and recently as a key research topic.

#### BACKGROUND

When we burn gasoline in our cars, use electricity from burning natural gas or coal at power plants, or chop down and burn tropical forests for new agricultural land, we release carbon dioxide  $(CO_2)$  gas into the air. The quantity of carbon released by human activities is enormous. For 2008, the most recent year for which we have published data, total human  $CO_2$  emissions were about 10 billion tons of carbon annually (equivalent to one million tons per hour or, on a per capita basis, ~ 0.2 kg person<sup>-1</sup> h<sup>-1</sup>; note that 1 billion tons equals 1 Pg or 1 x 10<sup>15</sup> g). Of this amount,  $8.7 \pm 0.5$  billion tons originates from fossil fuel combustion and cement production and another  $1.2 \pm 0.7$  billion tons from deforestation (Le Quéré et al., 2009). The cumulative human CO<sub>2</sub> emissions over the industrial era now amount to close to 560 billion tons. A little less than half of this anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub> remains in the atmosphere certainly enough to be of grave concern as a greenhouse gas leading to climate change. The remainder is, at present, removed in roughly equal parts into the ocean and by land vegetation. Revelle and Suess (1957) wrote a prophetic view of our perturbations to the global carbon cycle: Thus human beings are now carrying out a large scale geophysical *experiment of a kind that could not have* happened in the past nor be reproduced *in the future*—a sentiment that may be especially true for ocean acidification.

The build-up of excess  $CO_2$  in the atmosphere is clearly evident in time series such as the one established in 1958 by Charles David Keeling from the top of Mauna Loa volcano in Hawaii, the longest atmospheric  $CO_2$  instrumental record. When Keeling started making measurements, atmospheric  $CO_2$  was about 315 parts per million (ppm) (Keeling, 1960); present values (387 ppm) are already more than 37% greater than pre-industrial levels (~ 280 ppm) (Feely et al., 2009; Tans, 2009). If fossil fuel consumption continues unabated, it could double or triple before the end of this century (Tans, 2009). The current rapid rise in atmospheric  $CO_2$  is as much as 30 times faster than natural rates in the geological past, and present levels are higher than at anytime in at least the last 850,000 years and likely several million years (Kump et al., 2009).

As atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> rises, thermodynamics and air-sea gas transfer processes drive some of the extra CO<sub>2</sub> into ocean surface waters, leading to substantial shifts in seawater acid-base chemistry and, importantly, the chemical speciation of the large reservoir of inorganic carbon dissolved in seawater (Figure 1). In aggregate, these chemical changes are termed "ocean acidification." The basic principles for these reactions have been appreciated for some time, and even before the start of the Mauna Loa record, Revelle and Suess (1957) argued that the ocean would quite effectively remove a large fraction of fossil fuel CO<sub>2</sub> from the atmosphere (see also Bolin and Eriksson, 1959).

The basic chemistry of ocean acidification was first described in the early 1970s, based on early models of  $CO_2$  exchange at the air-sea interface and the thermodynamics of the carbon system in seawater (Broecker et al., 1971, 1979; Broecker and Takahashi, 1977; Fairhall, 1973; Zimen and Altenhein, 1973; Whitfield, 1974; Skirrow and Whitfield, 1975; Pytkowicz and Small, 1977). Although these early authors all presented calculations to show that  $CO_2$  emissions would likely cause undersaturation with respect to aragonite and calcite at some point, their estimates of when this might happen varied greatly because of a lack of agreement on carbon system equilibrium in seawater at that time. As more laboratory and field results were published in the 1980s, it became clear that the high-latitude regions of the ocean would first become undersaturated with respect to aragonite sometime in the twenty-first century (Feely and Chen, 1982; Mucci, 1983; Byrne et al., 1984; Feely et al., 1984, 1988) and that tropical regions would remain supersaturated with respect to these minerals throughout the twenty-first century.

By the 1990s, an intense effort of ship-based surveys and ocean time series was underway to quantify the ocean's role in the climate system as a sink for human-released  $CO_2$  (Sabine et al.,

2004). Now, the alteration of seawater chemistry from the invasion of excess CO<sub>2</sub> into the ocean is also clear from these ongoing field observations (Dore et al., 2009; Fabry et al., 2009; Feely et al., 2009; Hauri et al., 2009). The analytical methods for seawater carbonate chemistry are now well established (Dickson et al., 2007). Coordinated observational strategies for monitoring ocean acidification (and its potential biological impacts; see below) are underway (Feely et al., in open review), applying traditional techniques as well as new approaches that employ satellite remote sensing (Gledhill et al., 2009; Balch and Utgoff, 2009) and autonomous platforms such as floats and gliders (Johnson et al., 2009; Bishop, 2009).



Figure 1: Time series of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> at Mauna Loa (in parts per million volume, ppmv; red), surface ocean  $pCO_2$  (µatm; blue) and surface ocean pH (green) at Ocean Station ALOHA in the subtropical North Pacific Ocean. Note that the increase in oceanic CO<sub>2</sub> over the past 17 years is consistent with the atmospheric increase within the statistical limits of the measurements. *Mauna Loa data courtesy of Pieter Tans, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration/Earth System Research Laboratory (http://www.esrl.noaa.gov/gmd/ccgg/trends); Hawaii Ocean Time-Series (HOT)/ALOHA data courtesy of David Karl, University of Hawaii (http://hahana.soest.hawaii.edu; see also Dore et al., 2009)* 

Concerns also arose about how marine ecosystems might respond to ocean warming and changes in circulation caused by alterations in the planet's radiative balance from the elevated CO<sub>2</sub> in the atmosphere (Boyd and Doney, 2002). By contrast, the biological effects of rising atmospheric and oceanic CO<sub>2</sub> directly on marine life was a rather obscure topic through much of the 1980s and early 1990s, explored by only a few scientists. Several groundbreaking studies, specifically designed to test atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> impacts, revealed potentially dramatic responses in corals and coral reef communities (e.g., Gattuso et al., 1998; Marubini and Atkinson, 1999; Kleypas et al., 1999; Langdon et al., 2000) and planktonic organisms (e.g., Riebesell et al., 2000). Broad interest and visibility on the topic were spurred by an influential Royal Society report (Royal Society, 2005) and the 2004 Symposium on the Ocean in a High-CO<sub>2</sub> World (Orr et al., 2009). Toward the end of this decade, there is now striking evidence from the laboratory and field that many marine species may be affected by ocean acidification

Scott C. Doney (sdoney@whoi.edu) is Senior Scientist, Marine Chemistry and Geochemistry, Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution, Woods Hole, MA, USA. William M. Balch is Senior Research Scientist, Bigelow Laboratory for Ocean Sciences, West Boothbay Harbor, ME, USA. Victoria J. Fabry is Professor, Department of Biological Sciences, California State University, San Marcos, San Marcos, CA, USA. Richard A. Feely is Senior Scientist, Pacific Marine Environmental Laboratory, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, Seattle, WA, USA. (e.g., see recent review papers: Kleypas et al., 2006; Fabry et al., 2008; Guinotte and Fabry, 2008; Doney et al., 2009; Kleypas and Yates, 2009).

#### **BIOLOGICAL IMPACTS**

Unlike the case for terrestrial plants, many marine phytoplankton species are not limited by aqueous CO<sub>2</sub> gas concentrations, having developed biochemical techniques for concentrating CO<sub>2</sub> inside their cells or by tapping into the much larger seawater pool of dissolved inorganic carbon (e.g., Tortell et al., 1997). Recent work, however, suggests that photosynthesis rates of some cyanobacteria may be enhanced under elevated aqueous CO<sub>2</sub>, especially in conjunction with warming, and that there may be a wide range of possible effects on nutrient cycling, including increased nitrogen fixation rates (Hutchins et al., 2009). Phytoplankton growth may also be influenced by CO<sub>2</sub>-driven changes in acid-base chemistry and trace metal availability (Millero et al., 2009). Similarly, the pH gradient across cell membranes is coupled to numerous critical physiological/biochemical reactions within marine organisms, ranging from such diverse processes as photosynthesis, to nutrient transport, to respiratory metabolism. The impact of ocean acidification (and changing pH gradients) on this biochemistry is barely understood (Figure 2).

Increased solubility of calcium carbonate minerals used as skeleton and shell material by corals (Cohen and Holcomb, 2009; Kleypas and Yates, 2009) and other pelagic and benthic calcifiers (Fabry et al., 2009a, 2009b; Balch and Utgoff, 2009) generally results in a slowdown of the overall calcification process by mechanisms that are just beginning to be understood (Cohen and Holcomb, 2009). In fact, the response of calcifying organisms to ocean acidification may be more varied than first thought, as indicated in recent experiments showing elevated calcification rates for some taxa under higher  $CO_2$  (Ries et al., 2009). Decreased calcification could have negative impacts on marine ecosystems, with consequent effects on local marine fisheries and coastal protection from storms. The abundance of commercially important shellfish species (i.e., clams, oysters, sea urchins) could also decline, which could have serious consequences for marine food resources (Cooley et al., 2009).

#### PHYSICAL IMPACTS

A generally unappreciated physical impact of ocean acidification is the reduction of low-frequency sound adsorption because of the pH-dependent decline in dissolved borate ions (Brewer and Hester, 2009). As noted by Brewer and Hester (2009), the effect can be significant: "a decline in pH of only 0.3 causes a 40% decrease in the intrinsic sound absorption coefficient ( $\alpha$ , dB km<sup>-1</sup>)." Nevertheless, the environmental consequences of increased "noise" in the ocean, particularly with respect to whales and other marine mammals, is largely unknown.

Along with sound propagation, light propagation might also be affected. In a "decalcified" ocean, devoid of the ubiquitous calcium carbonate particles such as microscopic coccoliths, light scattering and attenuation would be reduced, resulting in deeper euphotic zones. This scenario could have consequences for such biogeochemical aspects as export

	RESPONSE TO INCREASING CO <sub>2</sub>				
PHYSIOLOGICAL RESPONSE MAJOR GROUP	# SPECIES STUDIED				
CALCIFICATION					
Coccolithophores	4	2	1	1	1
Planktonic Foraminifera	2	2	_	-	-
Molluscs	6	5	-	1	-
Echinoderms	3	2	1	_	-
Tropical Corals	11	11	-	-	-
Coralline Red Algae	1	1	1	_	-
PHOTOSYNTHESIS <sup>1</sup>					
Coccolithophores <sup>2</sup>	2	-	2	2	-
Prokaryotes	2	_	1	1	-
Seagrasses	5	-	5	-	-
NITROGEN FIXATION					
Cyanobacteria	4	-	3	1	-
REPRODUCTION					
Molluscs	4	4	-	-	-
Echinoderms	1	1	_	-	-

Figure 2. Representative examples of impacts of ocean acidification on major groups of marine biota derived from experimental manipulation studies. The response curves on the right indicate four cases: (a) linear negative, (b) linear positive, (c) level, and (d) nonlinear parabolic responses to increasing levels of seawater  $pCO_2$  for each of the groups. Adapted from Doney et al. (2009)

 $^1$  Strong interactive effects with nutrient and trace metal availability, light, and temperature  $^2$  Under nutrient replete conditions

# BOX 1. ORGANIZATIONS DEVOTING SIGNIFICANT RESOURCES TO OCEAN ACIDIFICATION

# SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH CONSORTIA

# The European Project on Ocean Acidification (EPOCA) *http://www.epoca-project.eu*

A consortium of European researchers examining ocean acidification's progress and effects on marine life, and using scientific results to develop educational materials for stakeholders.

## Integrated Marine Biogeochemistry and Ecosystem Research (IMBER)/Surface Ocean Lower Atmosphere Study (SOLAS) Joint Carbon Working Group

*http://www.imber.info/C\_WG\_SubGroup3.html* A working group composed of international researchers tasked with coordinating and synthesizing ocean acidification research activities worldwide.

### International Geosphere-Biosphere Programme (IGBP) and the Scientific Committee on Oceanic Research (SCOR) Fast Track Initiative

http://igbp-scor.pages.unibe.ch

A research consortium of international researchers studying ocean acidification from a paleoenvironmental perspective

# Marine Climate Change Impacts Partnership (MCCIP)

http://www.mccip.org.uk

A coordinating body of United Kingdom-based researchers cooperating to provide information to decision makers.

# Ocean Carbon and Biogeochemistry (OCB) Office *http://www.us-ocb.org*

A United States-based coordinating body composed of scientific researchers tasked with promoting dialogue and collaboration among researchers and developing educational materials in support of national funding agencies' goals.

# NONPROFIT ORGANIZATIONS

#### Natural Resources Defense Council

*http://www.nrdc.org/oceans/acidification/default.asp* A United States-based environmental action group working to protect Earth's natural assets.

#### Ocean Conservancy

http://www.oceanconservancy.org

A United States-based conservation organization dedicated to educating citizens about the current challenges facing ocean ecosystems and promoting conservation-based legislation.

# EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS

#### CarboSchools

http://www.carboeurope.org/education

EPOCA-affiliated organization promoting partnerships between researchers and secondary educators and facilitating several regional projects designed to help students connect climate change issues with their local environment.

# Center for Microbial Oceanography: Research and Education (C-MORE)

http://cmore.soest.hawaii.edu/index.htm

A consortium of American institutions bringing together scientists, educators, and communities to highlight the importance of marine microbes.

# BOX 2. INFORMATION ABOUT OCEAN ACIDIFICATION

# EDUCATIONAL TOOLS

Acid Test: The Global Challenge of Ocean Acidification http://www.nrdc.org/oceans/acidification/aboutthefilm.asp NRDC-produced short documentary narrated by Sigourney Weaver providing an overview of ocean acidification.

#### C-MORE Ocean Acidification Teaching Module

http://cmore.soest.hawaii.edu/education/teachers/science\_kits/ ocean\_acid\_kit.htm

Three-lesson kit for grades 6–12 including DVD, presentations, worksheets, and experiment materials that can be borrowed from a C-MORE partner institution.

#### OCB Ocean Acidification Lab Kit

*http://www.us-ocb.org/publications/OCB-OA\_labkit102609.pdf* OCB-produced lab kit for teachers of grades 5–12 providing complete plans, worksheets, and shopping lists for two inexpensive laboratory activities and one demonstration.

#### Acid Ocean Virtual Lab

*http://i2i.stanford.edu/carbonlab/co2lab.swf* Stanford University-developed online laboratory activities teaching about ocean acidification's impact on marine organisms, especially sea urchins.

#### NEWS

#### http://oceanacidification.wordpress.com/

EPOCA maintains a blog, updated nearly every day, containing news and abstracts about ocean acidification, and links to ocean acidification coverage in the media.

#### http://iodeweb3.vliz.be/oanet/index.html

The Ocean Acidification Network collects information for the scientific community about ocean acidification.

### BRIEFINGS, FACT SHEETS, AND HELPFUL INFORMATION

European Science Foundation Science Policy Briefing: Impacts of Ocean Acidification http://www.esf.org/publications/policy-briefings.html

#### EUR-Oceans Ocean Acidification Fact Sheet

http://www.eur-oceans.info/EN/education/pdf/ FS7\_ocean%20acidification.pdf

### EPOCA Guide To Best Practices in Ocean Acidification Research and Data Reporting

http://www.epoca-project.eu/index.php/Home/ Guide-to-OA-Research (Draft available now, final document expected early 2010)

# The Honolulu Declaration on Ocean Acidification and Reef Management

http://www.nature.org/wherewework/northamerica/states/ hawaii/files/final\_declaration\_with\_appendices.pdf

### National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration Ocean Acidification Fact Sheet and Web Site

http://www.pmel.noaa.gov/co2/OA/Ocean\_Acidification %20FINAL.pdf http://www.pmel.noaa.gov/co2/OA

The Ocean in a High-CO<sub>2</sub> World: Ocean Acidification Summary for Policymakers from SCOR, UNESCO, IGBP, and IAEA (Also known as "The Monaco Declaration") http://ioc3.unesco.org/oanet/OAdocs/SPM-lorezv2.pdf

## MOVIES ON OCEAN ACIDIFICATION

### Natural Resource Defense Council Web Site On Ocean Acidification

http://www.nrdc.org/oceans/acidification http://www.nrdc.org/oceans/acidification/aboutthefilm.asp

"A Sea Change" http://www.aseachange.net production (Balch and Utgoff, 2009). It is not a stretch of the imagination to assume that the physical chemistry of seawater will change such that rates of redox reactions associated with metal oxidation and electolysis would change. This more applied chemistry would be of strategic importance to both shipping and naval interests, particularly as it affects the integrity of ship hulls.

# NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL RESPONSE TO OCEAN ACIDIFICATION

Over the last several years, the rapid pace of scientific discoveries has led to a dramatic rise in the visibility of, concern about, and urgency of ocean acidification. Nongovernmental organizations are issuing communiqués and declarations, and research programs on ocean acidification are being launched around the world at national and international levels (e.g., the European Project on Ocean Acidification [EPOCA] in the European Union; Gattuso et al., 2009; http://www.epoca-project.eu/; Orr et al., 2009). EPOCA has also developed a Guide for Best Practices in Ocean Acidification Research and Data Reporting for conducting research on ocean acidification under controlled laboratory conditions (Box 3; Riebesell et al., in press). In the United States, a key scientific workshop on the topic was organized under the Ocean Carbon and Biogeochemistry (OCB) Program (http://us-ocb.org/; Fabry et al., 2009b). Following the passage of the Federal Ocean Acidification Research And Monitoring (FOARAM) Act of 2009 (Public Law 111-11), the United States is formulating its own strategy for an integrated national research program on

# BOX 3. GUIDE TO BEST PRACTICES IN OCEAN ACIDIFICATION RESEARCH AND DATA REPORTING

BY ULF RIEBESELL, VICTORIA J. FABRY, LINA HANSSON, AND JEAN-PIERRE GATTUSO

Growing concern about the effects of ocean acidification on marine organisms and ecosystems has stimulated a wide range of research activities over the past few years. With new national and international programs recently started and others still in preparation, research aimed at detecting potential effects of ocean acidification on various processes and organisms will increase in the coming decade. Due to the crosscutting nature of the scientific problem, research on ocean acidification brings together a spectrum of disciplines, from paleo- and chemical oceanography, to marine biogeochemistry and climate modeling, to marine ecology, physiology, and molecular and evolutionary biology. The various scientific communities have their own disciplinary heritage, and frequently use specific terminology, research approaches, and methodologies. Moreover, with new funding opportunities now becoming available for ocean acidification research, many researchers, postdoctoral investigators, and PhD students with no or limited previous experience in ocean acidification research will enter the field. To ensure comparability of the vast amount of data generated in this rapidly expanding field of marine sciences and to achieve the highest possible data quality, it is important to agree on standardized protocols for observational and experimental approaches, carbonate chemistry manipulations and measurements, and data reporting.

In November 2008, the European Project on Ocean Acidification (EPOCA) and the International Oceanographic Commission (IOC) of UNESCO, organized an international workshop in Kiel, Germany,

**Ulf Riebesell** (uriebesell@ifm-geomar.de) is Professor, Biological Oceanography, Leibniz Institute of Marine Sciences (IFM-GEOMAR), Kiel, Germany. **Victoria J. Fabry** is Professor, Department of Biological Sciences, California State University, San Marcos, San Marcos CA, USA. **Lina Hansson** is Project Manager, European Project on Ocean Acidification (EPOCA), Laboratoire d'Océanographie, CNRS-Université Pierre et Marie Curie-Paris 6, Villefranche-sur-mer, France. **Jean-Pierre Gattuso** is Research Professor and Scientific Coordinator, EPOCA, Laboratoire d'Océanographie, CNRS-Université Pierre et Marie Curie-Paris 6, Villefranche-sur-mer, France." on Best Practices in Ocean Acidification Research. The workshop received funding from the Scientific Council on Oceanic Research (SCOR), the US Ocean Carbon Biogeochemistry program (OCB), and the Kiel Excellence Cluster *The Future Ocean*. The meeting brought together about 40 scientists from the European Union, United States, Japan, Korea, China, and Australia with expertise in different areas of ocean acidification research. Workshop participants reviewed best practices in this field and prepared an outline for a guide that served as a basis to produce—with the help of additional invited experts—a comprehensive set of guidelines on ocean acidification research<sup>1</sup>.

After a first round of anonymous expert reviews, revised sections were made available online for four months of open access community review starting in May 2009. Based on the comments and input of the international scientific community and the assigned chapter editors, the sections were further revised (drafts available at http://www.epoca-project.eu/ index.php/Best-Practices-Guide/). Notation, style, and structure were harmonized in a final round of editing by the chief editors. The Guide to Best Practices in Ocean Acidification Research and Data Reporting will be published as an EU report and made available online in early 2010. Its recommendations will be presented to the wider community, with a special emphasis on students and scientists new to ocean acidification research, in training workshops to be conducted within the framework of existing and upcoming ocean acidification projects. It is envisioned that the guide's recommendations will be revisited and-where appropriatefurther refined in a few years as understanding of ocean acidification advances and new techniques and approaches emerge.

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editors: Ulf Riebesell, Victoria J. Fabry, Lina Hansson, Jean-Pierre Gattuso

#### CHAPTER 1: SEAWATER CARBONATE CHEMISTRY Chapter Editors: Richard A. Feely, Kitack Lee

- 1.1 The Carbon Dioxide System in Sea Water: Equilibrium Chemistry and Measurements Andrew G. Dickson
- 1.2 Approaches and Tools to Manipulate the Carbonate Chemistry Jean-Pierre Gattuso, Kunshan Gao, Kitack Lee, Björn Rost, Kai G. Schulz

#### CHAPTER 2: EXPERIMENTAL DESIGN OF PERTURBATION EXPERIMENTS Chapter Editors: Mike Thorndyke, Jens Nejstgaard

- 2.1 Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> Targets for Ocean Acidification Perturbation Experiments James P. Barry, Toby Tyrrell, Lina Hansson, Gian-Kasper Plattner, Jean-Pierre Gattuso
- 2.2 Designing Ocean Acidification Experiments to Maximize Inference Jon Havenhand, Sam Dupont, Gerry Quinn
- 2.3 Bioassays, Batch Culture and Chemostat Experimentation Julie LaRoche, Björn Rost, Anja Engel
- 2.4 Pelagic Mesocosms Ulf Riebesell, Kitack Lee, Jens Nejstgaard
- 2.5 Laboratory Experiments and Benthic Mesocosm Studies Steve Widdicombe, Sam Dupont, Mike Thorndyke
- 2.6 In situ Perturbation Experiments: Natural Venting Sites, Spatial/Temporal Gradients in Ocean pH, Manipulative in situ p(CO<sub>2</sub>) Perturbations James P. Barry, Jason M. Hall-Spencer, Toby Tyrell

#### CHAPTER 3: MEASUREMENTS OF CO2 SENSITIVE PROCESSES

Chapter Editors: Victoria J. Fabry, Debora Iglesias-Rodriguez

- 3.1 Studies of Acid-Base Status and Regulation Hans-Otto Pörtner, Ulf Bickmeyer, Markus Bleich, Christian Bock, Colin Brownlee, Frank Melzner, Vasilios Michaelidis, Franz Josef Sartoris, Daniela Storch
- 3.2 Production and Export of Organic Matter Anja Engel, Joana Barcelos e Ramos, Richard Geider, David A. Hutchins, Cindy Lee, Björn Rost, Rüdiger Röttgers, Frede Thingstad
- 3.3 Direct Measurements of Calcification Rates in Planktonic Organisms Victoria J. Fabry, William M. Balch
- 3.4 Measurements of Calcification of Benthic Organisms and Communities Chris Langdon, Jean-Pierre Gattuso, Andreas Andersson

#### CHAPTER 4: DATA REPORTING AND DATA USAGE

Chapter Editors: Bronte Tilbrook, Marion Gehlen

- 4.1 Modeling Considerations Andreas Oschlies, Jeremy Blackford, Scott Doney, Marion Gehlen
- 4.2 Safeguarding and Sharing Ocean Acidification Knowledge Stéphane Pesant, Leslie Allan Hook, Roy Lowry, Gwenaelle Moncoiffe, Anne-Marin Nissuma, Benjamin Pfeil

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> It is recognized that the paleosciences will continue to provide important contributions to unraveling the consequences of ocean acidification. However, this field entails another broad spectrum of scientific approaches not covered in this guide to best practices. The paleo community may find it beneficial to formulate guidelines and standardized protocols specific for research on past acidification events.

ocean acidification (National Research Council, in press).

Ocean acidification is inherently an interdisciplinary topic, as reflected in the crosscutting nature of the papers in this issue. Relevant subject matters range from seawater carbonate, to acid-base and physical chemistry, to organismal physiology, food web dynamics, and biogeochemistry. Time scales span the geological record for the last 500 million years to the recent historical past and extend to projections for the near-term future of the twenty-first century and beyond. Unlike many other human perturbations to the marine environment, ocean acidification is widely distributed and will influence many biogeographic regions, including open-ocean planktonic systems, coastal upwelling zones, coral reefs, high latitudes, benthic environments, and the deep sea. Ocean acidification is stimulating research in areas ranging from basic, unresolved questions on the biochemistry of biomineralization (shell and skeleton formation from carbonate minerals) to the socio-economic impacts on marine fisheries, aquaculture, and other ecosystem services.

Unless there are dramatic changes in fossil fuel use, projected human-driven ocean acidification over this century will be larger and more rapid than anything affecting sea life for tens of millions of years. And the problem will be with us for a long time because it takes centuries to thousands of years for natural processes, primarily mixing into the deep-sea and increased dissolution of marine carbonate sediments, to remove excess carbon dioxide from the air. Future ocean acidification also will occur in conjunction with other human-driven stresses like global warming, pollution, overfishing, and coastal nutrient inputs. The solutions to ocean acidification are clear—slowing and eventually eliminating fossil fuel carbon emissions and, perhaps on longer time scales, developing approaches for removing excess carbon dioxide from the atmosphere.

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We thank the National Science Foundation (NSF), National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), and National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA) for research support on ocean acidification. This special issue sprang in part from the Ocean Carbon and Biogeochemistry (OCB) Program (http://us-ocb.org/), and we specifically acknowledge grants supporting the OCB Project Office (NSF OCE-0622984, NSF OCE-0927287, and NASA NNX08AX01G). We also thank the many authors, co-authors, and reviewers who contributed to this volume. Richard A. Feely was supported by the NOAA Climate Program under the Office of Climate Observations (Grant No. GC04-314 and the Global Carbon Cycle Program (Grant No. GC05-288). Pacific Marine Environmental Laboratory contribution number 3489. 🗹

#### REFERENCES

- Balch, W.M., and P.E. Utgoff. 2009. Potential interactions among ocean acidification, coccolithophores, and the optical properties of seawater. *Oceanography* 22(4):146–159.
- Bishop, J.K.B. 2009. Autonomous observations of the ocean biological carbon pump. *Oceanography* 22(1):182–193. Available online at: http://tos.org/ oceanography/issues/issue\_archive/22\_2.html (accessed November 16, 2009).

- Bolin, B., and E. Eriksson. 1959. Changes in the carbon dioxide content of the atmosphere and the sea due to fossil fuel combustion. Pp. 130–142 in *The Atmosphere and the Sea in Motion*. Rockefeller Institute Press, New York, NY.
- Boyd, P.W., and S.C. Doney. 2002. Modeling regional responses by marine pelagic ecosystems to global climate change. *Geophysical Research Letters* 29(16), 1806, doi:10.1029/2001GL014130.
- Brewer, P.G., and K. Hester. 2009. Ocean acidification and the increasing transparency of the ocean to low-frequency sound. *Oceanography* 22(4):86–93.
- Broecker, W.S., and T. Takahashi. 1977. Neutralization of fossil fuel CO<sub>2</sub> by marine calcium carbonate.
  Pp. 213–241 in *The Fate of Fossil Fuel CO<sub>2</sub>*.
  N. Anderson and A. Malahoff, eds, Plenum Press, New York, NY.
- Broecker, W.S., Y.H. Li, and T.-H. Peng. 1971. Carbon dioxide: Man's unseen artifact. Pp. 287–324 in *Impingement of Man on the Oceans*. D.W. Hood, ed., Wiley-Interscience, Malden, MA.
- Broecker, W.S., T. Takahashi, H.J. Simpson, and T.-H. Peng. 1979. Fate of fossil fuel carbon dioxide and the global carbon budget. *Science* 206:409–418.
- Byrne, R.H., J.G. Acker, P.R. Betzer, R.A. Feely, and M.H. Cates. 1984. Water column dissolution of aragonite in the Pacific Ocean. *Nature* 312:321–326.
- Cohen, A.L., and M. Holcomb. 2009. Why corals care about ocean acidification: Uncovering the mechanism. *Oceanography* 22(4):118–127.
- Cooley, S.R., H.L. Kite-Powell, and S.C. Doney. 2009. Ocean acidification's potential to alter global marine ecosystem services. *Oceanography* 22(4):172–181.
- Dickson, A.G., C.L. Sabine, and J.R. Christian, eds. 2007. Guide to Best Practices for Ocean CO<sub>2</sub> Measurements. PICES Special Publication 3, 191 pp.
- Doney, S.C., V.J. Fabry, R.A. Feely, and J.A. Kleypas. 2009. Ocean acidification: The other CO<sub>2</sub> problem. *Annual Review of Marine Science* 1:169–192.
- Dore, J.E., R. Lukas, D.W. Sadler, M.J. Church, and D.M. Karl. 2009. Physical and biogeochemical modulation of ocean acidification in the central North Pacific. *Proceedings of the National Academy* of Sciences of the United States of America. 106:12,235–12,240.
- Fabry, V.J., J.B. McClintock, J.T. Mathis, and J.M. Grebmeier. 2009a. Ocean acidification at high latitudes: The bellwether. *Oceanography* 22(4):160–171.
- Fabry, V.J., C. Langdon, W.M. Balch, A.G. Dickson, R.A. Feely, B. Hales, D.A. Hutchins, J.A. Kleypas, and C.L. Sabine. 2009b. Present and Future Impacts of Ocean Acidification on Marine Ecosystems and Biogeochemical Cycles. Report of the Ocean Carbon and Biogeochemistry Program Scoping Workshop on Ocean Acidification Research held October 9–11, 2007, La Jolla, CA, 51 pp. Available online from http://www.us-ocb.org/publications/ OCB\_OA\_rept.pdf (accessed November 16, 2009).

Fabry, V.J., B.A. Seibel, R.A. Feely, and J.C. Orr. 2008. Impacts of ocean acidification on marine fauna and ecosystem processes. *ICES Journal of Marine Science* 65:414–432.

Fairhall, A.W. 1973. Accumulation of fossil CO<sub>2</sub> in atmosphere and sea. *Nature* 245:20–23.

Feely, R.A., and C.-T.A. Chen. 1982. The effect of excess CO<sub>2</sub> on the calculated calcite and aragonite saturation horizons in the northeast Pacific. *Geophysical Research Letters* 9:1,294–1,297.

Feely, R.A., R.H. Byrne, J.G. Acker, P.R. Betzer, C.-T.A. Chen, J.F. Gendron, and M.F. Lamb. 1988. Winter-summer variations of calcite and aragonite saturation in the northeast Pacific. *Marine Chemistry* 25:227–241.

Feely, R.A., R.H. Byrne, P.R. Betzer, J.F. Gendron, and J.G. Acker. 1984. Factors influencing the degree of saturation of the surface and intermediate waters of the North Pacific Ocean with respect to aragonite. *Journal of Geophysical Research* 89(C6):10,631–10,640.

Feeley, R.A., S.C. Doney, and S.R. Cooley. 2009. Ocean acidification: Present conditions and future changes in a high-CO<sub>2</sub> world. *Oceanography* 22(4):36–47.

Feely, R.A., V.J. Fabry, A. Dickson, J.-P. Gattuso, J. Bijma, U. Riebesell, S. Doney, C. Turley, T. Saino, K. Lee, and others. In open review. An International Observational Network for Ocean Acidification. Ocean Observations Conference 2009 Report. Available online at: http://www.oceanobs09.net/blog/?p=78 (accessed November 18, 2009).

Gattuso, J.-P., M. Frankignoulle, I. Bourge, S. Romaine, and R.W. Buddemeier. 1998. Effect of calcium carbonate saturation of seawater on coral calcification. *Global and Planetary Change* 18:37–46.

Gattuso, J.-P., L. Hansson, and the EPOCA Consortium. 2009. European Project on Ocean Acidification (EPOCA): Objectives, products, and scientific highlights. *Oceanography* 22(4):190–201.

Gledhill, D.K., R. Wanninkhof, and C.M. Eakin. 2009. Observing ocean acidification from space. *Oceanography* 22(4):48–59.

Guinotte, J.M., and V.J. Fabry. 2008. Ocean acidification and its potential effects on marine ecosystems. *Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences* 1134:320–342.

Hauri, C., N. Gruber, G.-K. Plattner, S. Alin, R.A. Feely, B. Hales, and P.A. Wheeler. 2009. Ocean acidification in the California Current System. *Oceanography* 22(4):60–71.

Hutchins, D.A., M.R. Mulholland, and F. Fu. 2009. Nutrient cycles and marine microbes in a CO<sub>2</sub>-enriched ocean. *Oceanography* 22(4):128–145.

Johnson, K.S., W.M. Berelson, E.S. Boss, Z. Chase, H. Claustre, S.R. Emerson, N. Gruber, A. Körtzinger, M.J. Perry, and S.C. Riser. 2009. Observing biogeochemical cycles at global scales with profiling floats and gliders: Prospects for a global array. *Oceanography* 22(3):216–225. Available online at: http://tos.org/oceanography/ issues/issue\_archive/issue\_pdfs/22\_3/22-3\_ johnson.pdf (accessed November 16, 2009).

Keeling, C.D. 1960. The concentration and isotopic abundances of carbon dioxide in the atmosphere. *Tellus* XII:200–203.

Kleypas, J.A., and K.K. Yates. 2009. Coral reefs and ocean acidification. *Oceanography* 22(4):108–117.

Kleypas, J.A., R.W. Buddemeier, D. Archer, J.P. Gattuso, C. Langdon, and B.N. Opdyke. 1999. Geochemical consequences of increased atmospheric carbon dioxide on coral reefs. *Science* 284:118–120.

Kleypas, J.A., R.A. Feely, V.J. Fabry, C. Langdon,
C.L. Sabine, and L.L. Robbins. 2006. *Impacts of* Ocean Acidification on Coral Reefs and Other Marine Calcifiers: A Guide to Future Research.
Report of a Workshop Held April 18–20, 2005,
St. Petersburg, FL, Sponsored by NSF, NOAA, and the US Geological Survey, 88 pp. Available online at: http://www.isse.ucar.edu/florida/ (accessed November 16, 2009).

Kump, L.R., T.J. Bralower, and A. Ridgwell. 2009. Ocean acidification in deep time. *Oceanography* 22(4):94–107.

Langdon, C., T. Takahashi, C. Sweeney, D. Chipman, J. Goddard, F. Marubini, H. Aceves, H. Barnett, and M. Atkinson. 2000. Effect of calcium carbonate saturation state on the calcification rate of an experimental coral reef. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles* 14:639–654.

Le Quéré, C., M.R. Raupach, J.G. Canadell, G. Marland, L. Bopp, P. Ciais, T.J. Conway, S.C. Doney, R.A. Feely, P. Foster, and others. 2009. Trends in the sources and sinks carbon dioxide. *Nature Geoscience* 2:831–836, doi:10.1038/ngeo689.

Marubini, F., and M.J. Atkinson. 1999. Effects of lowered pH and elevated nitrate on coral calcification. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 188:117–21.

Millero, F.J., R. Woosley, B. DiTrolio, and J. Waters. 2009. Effect of ocean acidification on the speciation of metals in seawater. *Oceanography* 22(4):72–85.

Mucci, A. 1983. The solubility of calcite and aragonite in seawater at various salinities, temperatures and 1 atmosphere total pressure. *American Journal of Science* 238:780–799.

National Research Council. In press. Development of an Integrated Science Strategy for Ocean Acidification Monitoring, Research, and Impacts Assessment. National Academies Press, Washington, DC.

Orr, J.C., K. Caldeira, V. Fabry, J.-P. Gattuso, P. Haugan, P. Lehodey, S. Pantoja, H.-O. Pörtner, U. Riebesell, T. Trull, and others. 2009. Research priorities for understanding ocean acidification: Summary from the Second Symposium on the Ocean in a High-CO<sub>2</sub> World. *Oceanography* 22(4):182–189.

Pytkowicz, R.M., and L.M. Small. 1977. Fossil fuel problem and carbon dioxide: An overview. Pp. 7–31 in *The Fate of Fossil Fuel CO*<sub>2</sub>.
N. Anderson and A. Malahoff, eds, Plenum Press, New York. Revelle, R., and H.E. Suess. 1957. Carbon dioxide exchange between atmosphere and ocean and the question of an increase of atmospheric  $CO_2$  during the past decades. *Tellus* 9:18–27.

Riebesell, U., V.J. Fabry, and J.-P. Gattuso, eds. In press. *Guide for Best Practices in Ocean Acidification Research and Data Reporting*. Available online at: http://www.epoca-project.eu/index.php/ Home/Guide-to-OA-Research/ (accessed November 16, 2009).

Riebesell, U., I. Zondervan, B. Rost, P.D. Tortell, R.E. Zeebe, and F.M.M. Morel. 2000. Reduced calcification of marine plankton in response to increased atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. *Nature* 407:364–367.

Ries, J.B., A.L. Cohen, and D.C. McCorkle. 2009. Marine calcifiers exhibit mixed responses to CO<sub>2</sub>-induced ocean acidification. *Geology* 37(12):1,057–1,152.

Royal Society. 2005. Ocean Acidification Due to Increasing Atmospheric Carbon Dioxide. The Royal Society, London UK, 57 pp.

Sabine, C.L., R.A. Feely, N. Gruber, R.M. Key, K. Lee, J.L. Bullister, R. Wanninkhof, C.S. Wong, D.W.R. Wallace, B. Tilbrook, and others. 2004. The oceanic sink for anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub>. *Science* 305:367–371.

Skirrow, G., and M. Whitfield. 1975. Effect of increases in the atmospheric carbon-dioxide content on the carbonate ion concentration of surface ocean water at 25°C. Limnology and Oceanography 20:103–108.

Tans, P. 2009. An accounting of the observed increase in oceanic and atmospheric  $CO_2$  and an outlook for the future. *Oceanography* 22(4):26–35.

Tortell, P.D., J.R. Reinfelder, and F.M.M. Morel. 1997. Active uptake of bicarbonate by diatoms. *Nature* 390:243–244.

Whitfield, M. 1974. Accumulation of fossil CO<sub>2</sub> in the atmosphere and in the sea. *Nature* 247:523–525.

Zimen, K.E., and F.K. Altenhein. 1973. The future burden of industrial CO<sub>2</sub> on the atmosphere and the oceans. *Naturwissenschaften* 60:198–199.