

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

**Ciliates along oxyclines of permanently stratified marine water columns**

V.P. Edgcomb\*<sup>1</sup> and Maria Pachiadaki<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Geology and Geophysics, Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution  
Woods Hole, MA, 02543 USA

\*Correspondence should be sent to VE at [vedgcomb@whoi.edu](mailto:vedgcomb@whoi.edu)

Keywords: ciliate, oxycline, marine, water column, permanently-stratified

**23 Abstract**

24 Studies of microbial communities in areas of the world where permanent marine water  
25 column oxyclines exist suggest they are ‘hotspots’ of microbial activity, and that these  
26 water features and the anoxic waters below them are inhabited by diverse protist taxa,  
27 including ciliates. These communities have minimal taxonomic overlap with those in  
28 overlying oxic water columns. Some ciliate taxa have been detected in multiple locations  
29 where these stable water column oxyclines exist, however, differences in such factors as  
30 hydrochemistry in the habitats that have been studied suggest local selection for distinct  
31 communities. We compare published data on ciliate communities from studies of deep  
32 marine water column oxyclines in Caricao Basin, Venezuela, and the Black Sea, with  
33 data from coastal, shallower oxycline waters in Framvaren and Mariager fjords, and from  
34 several deep-sea hypersaline anoxic basins (DHABs) in the Eastern Mediterranean Sea.  
35 Putative symbioses between Bacteria, Archaea, and ciliates observed along these  
36 oxyclines suggests a strategy of cooperative metabolism for survival that includes  
37 chemosynthetic autotrophy and exchanges of metabolic intermediates or end products  
38 between hosts and their prokaryotic partners.

39

40

41

42

## 43 **Introduction**

44

45 Around 1.8 billion years ago when deep ocean water masses were still mostly anaerobic  
46 (Schopf and Klein, 1992), eukaryotic life evolved on Earth, and over the last century  
47 anoxic marine habitats have provided fertile hunting grounds for novel protist taxa whose  
48 genetic signatures and cellular architecture have helped us to understand the evolution of  
49 single-celled eukaryotes. More recently, at least in part due to the global expansion of  
50 marine hypoxic and anoxic zones (Diaz and Rosenberg 2008), the microbiology of  
51 oxygen-depleted marine habitats has come under increased scrutiny from the perspective  
52 of needing to understand the likely impacts of increased oxygen depletion on marine food  
53 webs. Microbial eukaryotes are now recognized as pivotal members of aquatic microbial  
54 communities in numerical models of carbon cycling and in paradigms of surface and  
55 deep-ocean microbial ecology (Aristegui et al. 2009). They impact carbon and other  
56 nutrient cycles directly and indirectly, through grazing on prokaryotic prey and  
57 consequent regeneration of nutrients, and modification or re-mineralization of organic  
58 matter (particulate and dissolved) (Sherr and Sherr 2002; Taylor et al. 1986). In addition,  
59 they are known to affect the population dynamics, activity and physiological state of their  
60 prey (Lin et al. 2007). The main sources of mortality for marine microbes are  
61 phagotrophic protists and viruses (Aristegui et al. 2009; Suttle 2005) and the primary  
62 bacterial grazing is by flagellated protists and ciliates (Sherr and Sherr 2002; Frias-Lopez  
63 et al. 2009). The widespread application of culture-independent molecular approaches,  
64 primarily based on analysis of ribosomal RNA gene sequences amplified from  
65 environmental samples, and more recently advanced by introduction of Next Generation  
66 Sequencing methods, has revolutionized our understanding of the structure and  
67 complexity of marine microbial communities, including environments such as anoxic and  
68 deep-sea habitats. Genetic diversity detected within known protist taxa and also  
69 representing new taxa, is much greater than previously suspected using culture-based  
70 approaches, which are highly selective and appear currently capable of detecting only a  
71 fraction of taxa in environmental samples. Our understanding of eukaryotic microbial  
72 diversity along marine water column oxyclines, or transition zones between oxic seawater  
73 and anoxic/sulfidic waters, and within anoxic waters, however, lags far behind our  
74 knowledge of photic zone communities. These redox zones are found worldwide, and are  
75 now known to be hotspots of microbial activity. The steep physicochemical gradients  
76 typical of these redox zones make possible a wide range of microbial physiologies. The  
77 prokaryotic communities behind the intensive biogeochemical cycling that takes place in  
78 these habitats provide a type of microbial 'smorgasbord' for phagotrophic protists. Only  
79 recently have the activities and impacts of protist grazing been measured along such  
80 marine oxyclines (Anderson et al. 2012 Baltic Sea, Detmer et al. 1993 Baltic Sea, Lin et  
81 al. 2007 Cariaco Basin).

82 Ciliates are present in almost every habitat on Earth, and are commonly found in oxygen  
83 depleted and anoxic marine habitats (Lynn, 2008). They are distinguished by their  
84 dimorphic nuclei (large macronucleus accompanied by a small micronucleus), and  
85 conspicuous cilia that are present in at least some stage(s) of their life cycle. Ciliates are  
86 members of the protist superphylum Alveolata. Alveolates are among the most abundant  
87 and diverse groups of protists in marine environments (e.g., Lopez-Garcia et al. 2001;  
88 Moon-van der Staay et al. 2001; Edgcomb et al. 2011), and an anaerobic lifestyle appears

89 to have evolved independently in many unrelated ciliate groups, including the  
90 karyorelictids, prostomatids, haptorids, trichostomatids, entodiniomorphids, suctorids,  
91 scuticocilliatids, heterotrichids, odontostomatids, oligotrichids, and hypotrichids, some of  
92 which may be facultative anaerobes (Fenchel and Finlay 1995; Corliss 1979). Ciliates are  
93 one of the most conspicuous and best-studied taxa in many anaerobic communities  
94 (Fenchel and Finlay 1995). Aerobes and anaerobes are found within Ciliophora, and  
95 within anaerobes, energy metabolisms that include glycolysis and mixed acid  
96 fermentation have been described (Fenchel and Finlay 1995). Taxa found in anaerobic  
97 habitats all have mitochondria or mitochondria-like organelles called hydrogenosomes,  
98 and pyruvate oxidation through  $H_2$ -excretion appears central to their anaerobic lifestyle  
99 (Fenchel and Finlay 1991). Anderson et al. (2013) used RNA-SIP to demonstrate that  
100 prostomatid ciliates were among the active grazers of important chemolithoautotrophic  
101 epsilonproteobacteria found along pelagic oxyclines in the Baltic Sea. Protist grazing was  
102 found to balance cell production of this group of bacteria, indicating the importance of  
103 protist (including ciliate) grazing in regulating abundances of key redoxcline species, and  
104 in turn, influencing biogeochemical cycling.

105  
106 Hypoxic ( $< 20\mu M O_2$ ) and anoxic zones can appear in coastal regions and  
107 continental seas as a result of ecosystem responses to nutrient loading and/or coastal  
108 upwelling zones. Coastal eutrophication leads to decreases in dissolved oxygen as death  
109 of planktonic algae introduces increased organic material to fuel microbial respiration in  
110 underlying waters (Diaz and Rosenberg 2008). Such expanding oxygen depleted zones  
111 have serious implications for marine food webs, and one of the best ways to understand  
112 their impacts is to study permanently anoxic 'endmember' habitats. Here, we define  
113 'oxycline' as the region of a stratified water column where oxygen approaches  
114 undetectable levels down to where sulfide starts to appear. We focus this paper on studies  
115 that report on ciliate communities along the oxycline and in anoxic waters of several  
116 contrasting endmember sites that vary in depth and salinity. Most of these studies are  
117 based solely on molecular data presenting small subunit ribosomal RNA gene (SSU  
118 rDNA) diversity detected in environmental samples. Due to high and highly variable  
119 copy numbers of this gene within ciliate taxa (Gong et al. 2013) we interpret relative  
120 abundance of different ciliate taxa with caution. While additional stable anoxic marine  
121 water column habitats exist, the ones discussed here represent the best studied for protist  
122 diversity. The sizes of these water masses vary, as does their degree of influence from  
123 riverine inputs, trophic responses to differential prey, temperature, and rates of primary  
124 production in their overlying waters. These differences are likely to select for unique  
125 communities in the oxyclines and anoxic waters of each site.

126 The Cariaco Basin, north of Venezuela, is the world's largest truly marine anoxic  
127 system, which has remained anoxic for millions of years (Robertson and Burke 1989),  
128 although it probably experience periods of oxidation (Lin et al. 2008; Peterson et al.  
129 2000) (Figure 1). The Black Sea is the largest brackish anoxic basin. A 20- to 40-m-thick  
130 suboxic transitional zone, characterized by low oxygen ( $< 5\mu M$ ) and undetectable sulfide,  
131 persists throughout the basin between the surface oxic layer and the sulfidic anoxic deep  
132 water ( $\geq 100$  m) (Jørgensen et al., 1991). On the other hand, Framvaren Fjord and  
133 Mariager Fjord in Northern Europe are coastal brackish features with stable oxyclines  
134 within the zone of significant light penetration ( $\sim 10$ -20 m water depth), making them

135 interesting comparisons to aforementioned systems. Deep Hypersaline Anoxic Basins  
136 (DHABs) are located in the Eastern Mediterranean Sea, and most described DHABs were  
137 formed several thousand years ago through the dissolution of buried Messinian evaporitic  
138 deposits followed by brine accumulation in seafloor depressions (Cita 2006 and  
139 references therein). Their steep (typically narrow) and stable oxyclines (and haloclines)  
140 exist at more than 3000m below sea level (Figure 2).

141

## 142 **Cariaco Basin**

143

144 The Cariaco Basin is a representative ‘endmember’ habitat for oxygen depleted marine  
145 water columns. A relatively stable oxycline exists there between approximately 250 and  
146 350m water depth, and waters are anoxic and sulfidic down to the bottom of the basin at  
147 approximately 900-1200m depth. Early studies of Cariaco waters by Tuttle and Jannasch  
148 (1973, 1979) revealed active chemoautotrophic bacteria in and below the oxycline that  
149 can utilize reduced sulfur compounds for energy under both oxic and anoxic conditions.  
150 More recent studies have shown that chemolithoautotrophic activity in the redoxcline at  
151 times can match or even exceed rates of primary productivity in the surface water and  
152 support an active microbial food web at depth (Taylor et al. 2001). The first study of  
153 protist diversity in the Cariaco Basin revealed novel protist lineages in the anoxic portion  
154 of the water column, including signatures of what appeared to be a novel ciliate class  
155 (Stoeck et al. 2003) identified as ‘CAR\_H’. Edgcomb et al. (2011) expanded on this  
156 previous work by sampling the Basin extensively at three stations, in two contrasting  
157 seasons, and at four depths including the oxycline and deep, sulfidic (30  $\mu$ M sulfide)  
158 waters at 900m depth (Edgcomb et al. 2011; Orsi et al 2011).

159 The oxycline typically corresponds to a particle density maximum, and peaks in  
160 prokaryote and protist (including ciliates) cell numbers (Edgcomb et al. 2011; Lin et al.  
161 2008). Phagotrophic protists, including ciliates, are able to chemically sense prey and will  
162 aggregate in water features with higher prey concentrations (Fenchel, 1987; Sherr and  
163 Sherr, 1994). Clone library and GS FLX 454 sequence data on small subunit ribosomal  
164 RNA (SSU rRNA) gene signatures recovered from these two habitats revealed a picture  
165 of diverse protist communities that were dominated by Alveolata (36-43% of eukaryotic  
166 signatures, predominantly the ciliate subphylum Intramacronucleata, and four  
167 dinoflagellate orders, Gymnodiniales, Prorocentrales, Syndiniales, and Gonyaulacales)  
168 and Rhizaria). Canonical Correspondence analysis showed that the eastern and western  
169 sub-basins of the Cariaco contain unique protistan communities, which is driven in part  
170 by differences in riverine inputs and primary production in the two parts of the Basin.  
171 Additionally, communities were unique in different seasons (Orsi et al. 2011). Ninety  
172 percent of detected protistan operational taxonomic units (OTUs) at 97% sequence  
173 similarity were unique between the oxic overlying water column samples and anoxic  
174 waters below (Orsi et al. 2011).

175 Approximately 20% of the 18S rRNA clone library (16,000 clones) data and  
176 ~28% of GS FLX 454 data captured signatures of Ciliophora (Edgcomb et al. 2011).  
177 Taxa (orders and top BLAST hit to genus) detected in the oxycline and anoxic water  
178 samples are presented in Table 1. Assignment of these genetic signatures (given the  
179 ~100-200 bp 454 pyrotags) to genera should be interpreted cautiously. The ciliate taxa  
180 detected within the oxycline of Cariaco included *Metopus* (Armophorida), *Frontonia*

181 (Peniculida), *Euplotes* (Euplotida), *Oxytricha* (Sporadotrichida), *Strombidium*  
182 (Oligotrichida), *Cariacothrix* (Cariacotrichida), and unclassified taxa affiliated with  
183 Colpodida and Scuticociliatia. Relatives of *Metopus*, *Cariacothrix*, and *Strombidium*  
184 were also observed in the underlying anoxic waters of Cariaco, as well as relatives of  
185 *Cyclidium* (Pleuronematida), *Epalxella* (Odontostomida), *Prorodon* (Prorodontida), and  
186 unaffiliated members of Karyorelictida, Colpodida, and Scuticociliatia. This shift in  
187 ciliate taxa between the oxycline and anoxic/sulfidic waters is consistent with that  
188 observed along Baltic Sea redoxclines, although taxonomic composition of ciliate  
189 communities in the Baltic samples was different from Cariaco (Anderson et al. 2012).

190 Metopid ciliates are predators of bacteria that inhabit anoxic marine sediments,  
191 and members of this genus are known to have hydrogenosomes in close juxtaposition to  
192 endobiont methanogens. These endobionts are thought to play a role in conversion of  
193 hydrogenosomally produced hydrogen, carbon dioxide and acetate into methane and  
194 water (Fenchel and Finlay, 1991). Detection of these phagotrophic predators in the  
195 oxycline and anoxic waters of Cariaco suggests they are adapted to these low-  
196 oxygen/anoxic habitats. Species of *Frontonia* are commonly found in benthic and pelagic  
197 freshwater and marine habitats, and are voracious predators of bacteria, however they  
198 typically do not survive anoxia (see discussion in Yildiz and Senler 2013), explaining  
199 why they were not detected in the anoxic waters. The same pattern was observed for  
200 *Euplotes* and *Oxytricha*. Ciliates of the genus *Strombidium* are known dominant  
201 bacterivores along Baltic Sea redoxclines in suboxic zones, where their numbers reached  
202 up to 7 cells ml<sup>-1</sup> (Anderson et al. 2012). Members of *Cyclidium*, *Epalxella*,  
203 scuticociliates, and karyorelictid ciliates are known to inhabit marine anoxic and sulfidic  
204 habitats (Dyer 1989; Lynn 2008). *Prorodon* are mostly described to tolerate hypoxia  
205 (facultative anaerobes) and not total anoxia (Fenchel and Finlay 1990), however it is  
206 possible that anoxic relatives inhabit the Cariaco.

207 Molecular data for ciliates based on SSUrDNA genes provide information on the  
208 content of ciliate communities, but another approach, such as, microscopy, is needed to  
209 determine relative abundance within an environmental sample. Scanning electron  
210 microscopy of anoxic water samples from Caricao Basin indicated that ciliates were  
211 present at approximately 10<sup>4</sup>/L and that scuticociliates (belonging to the class  
212 Oligohymenophorea) and cells belonging to the recently described new ciliate class  
213 Cariacotrichea (Orsi et al. 2012) were most abundant. Abundance of scuticociliate types  
214 is consistent with recovery of their SSU rRNA genes in surveys of the seasonally anoxic  
215 Saanich Inlet and the stratified Framvaren Fjord (see below and Orsi et al. 2012c). An  
216 interesting observation was that >90% of ciliates observed on filtered anoxic water  
217 samples from that study exhibited visible epibiotic microbes (Figure 3), whereas no such  
218 associations between ciliates and prokaryotes were observed on filters prepared from oxic  
219 water samples. The identity of these putative symbionts has not yet been determined, but  
220 given the prevalence of these associations among ciliates in the anoxic waters of Cariaco,  
221 this appears to play a role in the adaptation of these eukaryotes to their anoxic lifestyle in  
222 these waters.

223

## 224 **Black Sea**

225

226 The Black Sea is the world's largest anoxic brackish water body. A strong density

227 stratification between lower salinity surface waters and higher salinity deeper waters  
228 results in a steep gradient of oxygen depletion below the halocline. Water below depths  
229 of about 100 m is anoxic and enriched with hydrogen sulfide (e.g. Jørgensen et al., 1991;  
230 Murray and Yakushev, 2006). A broad (20-30m) transitional zone is located between the  
231 oxic and anoxic/ sulfidic water layers. In this stable redox gradient both oxygen and  
232 hydrogen sulfide are close to the detection limit (Jørgensen et al., 1991). The Black Sea  
233 has long attracted the interest of microbial ecologists (Sorokin, 1972) but the majority of  
234 studies have focused on prokaryotic communities and their function. The first –  
235 microscopical – protist surveys of the suboxic and anoxic water layers of the Black Sea  
236 revealed a well-adapted community of flagellates and ciliates in the Black Sea redoxcline  
237 (e.g Zubkov et al., 1992). One group of ciliates consisting mainly of *Pleuronema*  
238 *marimus*, *Askenansia* sp. and species of the families Tracheliidae, Holophryidae and  
239 Amphileptidae inhabited the above the anoxic/upper boundary of H<sub>2</sub>S, while ciliates  
240 within the order Scuticociliatida – many of which bore ectobionts – dominated the upper  
241 sulfidic zone. The first molecular profile of protist diversity across the water column  
242 including the redoxcline in the Black Sea used denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis  
243 (DGGE) of amplified eukaryotic SSU rRNA (Coolen and Shtereva, 2009), and in contrast  
244 to microscopical studies presented a picture of poor protist richness. A more recent study  
245 (Wylezich and Jürgens, 2011) resolved this discrepancy and revealed, using the same  
246 methodological approach, a complex community structure of metabolically active protists  
247 with distinct shifts in composition along the redox gradient. The majority of DGGE bands  
248 occurred for the first time around the chemocline and are believed to likely represent  
249 organisms that can survive and actively grow under anoxic, sulfide-influenced conditions.

250 SSU rRNA libraries were constructed for two of the water features, the suboxic  
251 layer (130m) above the upper H<sub>2</sub>S boundary, and the anoxic sulfidic layer, where the  
252 peak in dark CO<sub>2</sub> fixations was observed (155m). The ciliate OTUs detected were 20 in  
253 total (eight unique to the suboxic library and eight to the sulfidic library, and four were  
254 present in both). Most of the ciliate sequences were found to be closely related to known  
255 cultured representatives such as *Cryptocaryon*, *Prorodon*, *Euplotes*, *Pleuronema*,  
256 *Strombidium*, *Pseudocohnilembus*, *Mesodinium* and *Myrionecta*, or to environmental  
257 clones from other hypoxic marine systems (Gotland and Cariaco Basins, DHABs and  
258 Framvaren Fjord). However, some of the Black Sea clones were only distantly related (<  
259 95% sequence similarity) to all known sequences from GenBank, and thus may represent  
260 new species or genera not detected by previous sequencing approaches. The sulfidic  
261 library produced the highest number of new sequence types, confirming the previously  
262 reported importance of this habitat for hitherto unknown microbial biodiversity (Stoeck et  
263 al., 2006). Scuticociliate sequences were common in clone libraries prepared using waters  
264 from both depths, but with a particular dominance in the sulfidic sample. Prostomatids  
265 were detected exclusively in the suboxic library, and plagiopylids exclusively in the  
266 sulfidic library. The OTU affiliated to *Pleuronema* was particularly dominant in the  
267 suboxic zone (70% of all clones), but was also present in the sulfidic zone. Another  
268 *Pleuronema*-like sequence was exclusively found within the suboxic clone library, while  
269 OTUs related to the oligohymenophorean genus *Cyclidium* and OTUs tightly clustered  
270 within the plagiopylids related to the genus *Epalxella*, were only detected in the sulfidic  
271 sample. The occurrence of plagiopylids and some of the scuticociliates (*Cyclidium*-  
272 related taxa) exclusively in sulfidic waters is in accordance with previous investigations

273 for such habitats (e.g. Stoeck and Epstein, 2003; Behnke et al., 2006; Zuendorf et al.,  
 274 2006; Stock et al., 2009). Most of the plagiopylid-like sequences were affiliated to the  
 275 hydrogenosome-bearing genera *Trimyema* and *Epalxella*, described from submarine  
 276 hydrothermal vents and a meromictic alpine lake (Baumgartner et al., 2002; Stoeck et al.,  
 277 2007a). The *Cyclidium*-related phylotypes clustered together with the anaerobic  
 278 *Cyclidium porcatum* (Clarke et al., 1993; Guggiari and Peck, 2008) and with other  
 279 environmental sequences originating from anoxic habitats (e.g. Framvaren Fjord, Cariaco  
 280 Basin). Species of this genus are known for having high intraspecific genetic divergence  
 281 (Fenchel and Finlay, 2006), and have often been detected in anoxic habitats using  
 282 morphological identification methods (Fenchel et al., 1990; Clarke et al., 1993; Guhl et  
 283 al., 1996) but also using molecular approaches; for example, in the sulfidic zone of the  
 284 Framvaren Fjord and the Gotland Deep redoxclines (Behnke et al., 2006; Stock et al.,  
 285 2009). Finally, one OTU related to the parasitic ciliate *Cryptocaryon irritans* was  
 286 detected. Although this parasite is able to survive in a free-living stage for a short while,  
 287 it seems to be only sporadically active in redoxclines and was previously detected in  
 288 libraries from Gotland Deep (Stock et al., 2009), Mariager Fjord (Zuendorf et al., 2006)  
 289 and Bannock interface (Edgcomb et al. 2009).

290

### 291 **Mariager and Framvaren Fjords**

292

293 Mariager and Framvaren Fjords are the most studied, permanently-stratified fjords  
 294 in terms of eukaryotic diversity. Both have shallow oxycline layers at 10-15m within the  
 295 photic zone. The first study of protist vertical composition in the Mariager Fjord, located  
 296 in the northern Denmark, was in 1990; microscopical observations revealed stratification  
 297 of the ciliate assemblages (Fenchel et al., 1990). *Cyclidium citrilus* and *Pleuronema* sp.  
 298 were found to dominate the oxycline; other common species were *Prorodon* sp., *Euplotes*  
 299 sp., *Uronychia transfuga* and *Peritromus* sp. In the deeper, anoxic water layers,  
 300 *Plagiophora frontata* and *Caenomorpha* sp. formed the highest population densities;  
 301 *Metopus controtus*, *Saprodyinium halophile*, *Lacrymaria* sp and a *Cyclidium*-like  
 302 morphotype were detected. A later study (Zuendorf et al, 2006) of a single water layer  
 303 below the oxycline (18m) using a DNA-based approach detected the molecular signatures  
 304 of almost all the above taxa, as well as ribocloned from the anaerobe trichostomatid  
 305 ciliates *Lechriopyla* and the oligotrich ciliate *Strombidium purpureum*.

306

307 The Framvaren Fjord, located in southwest Norway, contains the highest  
 308 concentration of H<sub>2</sub>S ever reported for an open anoxic basin reaching up to 6mM in the  
 309 deepest anoxic layers (Millero, 1991). Using SSU rDNA clone libraries Behnke and  
 310 colleagues (2006) were the first to provide molecular evidence of protist stratification  
 311 along this O<sub>2</sub>/H<sub>2</sub>S gradient. Three water features were investigated: the photic microoxic  
 312 interface (18 m), the lower redox transition zone/upper H<sub>2</sub>S boundary (23 m), and a  
 313 highly sulfidic layer with low microbial abundance (36 m). The highest protist OTU  
 314 richness was noted in the upper H<sub>2</sub>S boundary was in accordance with observations  
 315 obtained by light and fluorescence microscopy that revealed remarkably diverse  
 316 morphologies. It was hypothesized that chemoautotrophy, the dominant microbial  
 317 process in such habitats, supports a secondary microbial food web that stimulates the  
 318 growth of bacterivorous protists. As expected, the OTU richness in the high sulfide,  
 anoxic layer was the lowest. The most abundant protist group was the Alveolata and

319 within that, the ciliates. Sequences of known groups of anaerobic and micro-oxic ciliates  
320 such as the families Plagiopylidae, Strombiidae, Nyctotheridae, Cycliidae, and  
321 Prorodontidae, were retrieved from anoxic Framvaren waters. In a later study, the same  
322 group (Behnke et al., 2010) studied the spatio-temporal variation of protist communities  
323 in the aforementioned water features of the Framvaren Fjord. In all nine clone libraries (3  
324 habitats in 3 seasons), ciliates and stramenopiles accounted for the largest proportion of  
325 the total eukaryotic clones. Yet, as expected, at the OTU level, the protistan communities  
326 from distinct habitats differed significantly, with the number of shared OTUs between  
327 any two habitats being as low as 18%. This confirmed previous notions that  
328 environmental factors along the stratification gradient shape biodiversity patterns.  
329 Surprisingly, the intra-habitat community composition and structure varied at a  
330 comparable order of magnitude over time, with only 18–28% phylotypes shared within  
331 the same habitat. Regarding ciliates, 63% of phylotypes were present in only one of the  
332 libraries. According to the authors the observations provided support for the seed bank  
333 hypothesis (Pedros-Alio, 2006; Pedros-Alio, 2007), which states that taxa within the ‘rare  
334 biosphere’ provides the seed for shifts in community composition in response to changes  
335 in physicochemical conditions.

336

### 337 **Deep Hypersaline Anoxic Basins in the Eastern Mediterranean Sea**

338

339 Deep hypersaline anoxic basins (DHABs) found in the Eastern Mediterranean Sea  
340 are another example of stable marine oxycline habitats, however they are even more  
341 challenging environments for ciliates (and other eukaryotes) due to their hypersalinity  
342 and extreme depths. All of the basins that have been studied have unique  
343 hydrochemistries that result from the dissolution of different evaporitic strata laid down  
344 during the Messinian salinity crisis (examples shown in Table 2). For example,  $Mg^{2+}$   
345 concentrations in Discovery Basin can reach up to 5000mM compared with 300-650 mM  
346 in other basins, sodium concentrations can range from 70 mM (Discovery Basin) to 4700  
347 mM, methane concentrations are variable, and sulfide can be as high as 16 mM (Urania  
348 Basin) (van der Wielen et al. 2005). The oxyclines (and haloclines) of these basins are  
349 typically found more than 3000m below sea level (Table 2), and the extremely high  
350 densities of these basins (typically ranging from  $1.13$  to  $1.35 \times 10^3 \text{ kg m}^{-3}$ ) relative to  
351 Mediterranean seawater ( $1.03 \times 10^3 \text{ kg m}^{-3}$ ) lead to a stable and steep halocline that  
352 minimizes mixing with overlying normal salinity seawater (van der Wielen et al. 2005).  
353 Hypersaline environments are characterized by a low water content or water activity  
354 because of the high-salt concentrations, presenting challenges for organisms living in  
355 these habitats. Microbiota typically cannot tolerate water activity at or below 0.72, where  
356 there is not enough free water available for general metabolic processes, and for  
357 hydrating proteins and nucleic acids (Brock, 1994). Some DHABs have brines that  
358 originate from seawater (thalassohaline) and are dominated by sodium chloride, while  
359 others (e.g., Discovery Basin) have brines that originate from other ions (athalassohaline)  
360 (Litchfield 1998).

361

362 Ciliates are one group of protists that have long been known to be able to adapt to  
363 life in hypersaline environments (e.g., Post 1983). The first studies of protist diversity in  
364 several Eastern Mediterranean DHABs using DNA-based (Edgcomb et al. 2009) and  
RNA-based (Alexander et al. 2009) molecular approaches suggested that these habitats

365 and different basins harbored diverse and distinct protistan communities that included  
366 ciliates. While ciliates were relatively rare in the overlying normal seawater above  
367 Bannock Basin, the oxycline/halocline and brine water samples of Discovery and  
368 Bannock produced 75% SSU rDNA signatures (at 98% sequence similarity) affiliating  
369 with Alveolata, 12% of which represented ciliates, and 62% dinoflagellates (Edgcomb et  
370 al. 2009). Signatures of the strictly anaerobic Armophorea were unique to the chaotrophic  
371 Discovery sample, while heterotrich ciliate signatures occurred exclusively in the  
372 Bannock brine. While many ciliate signatures were detected that had no close sequenced  
373 affiliations in public databases, datasets from Bannock and Discovery oxycline/halocline  
374 and brine included known taxa such as, *Trimyema*, *Strombidium*, *Metopus*, and  
375 *Peritromus*. One clade of signatures was recovered from the thalassohaline Bannock  
376 interface that was highly divergent to *Cryptocaryon irritans*, an enigmatic parasite  
377 loosely affiliated with the class Prostomatea (Wright and Colomi 2002). When  
378 community membership was compared for Bannock and Discovery, Jaccard indices  
379 suggested that the communities were unique from one another and shared little (0.8-  
380 2.8%) in species composition with overlying waters with typical marine salinity and  
381 oxygen (Edgcomb et al. 2009).

382 It was presumed that the ciliates, which are successful phagotrophs, were likely  
383 feeding on the abundant bacteria present, particularly along the halocline, however being  
384 a DNA-based study it was difficult to infer activity from these signatures. The RNA-  
385 based study by Alexander et al. (2009) provided another line of evidence for active  
386 ciliates in the oxycline/halocline of a different basin, L'Atalante. This study compared  
387 18S rRNA gene signatures recovered from the upper (3499 m) and lower (3501 m)  
388 halocline of L'Atalante basin, where it was found that ciliates represented the largest  
389 proportion (18 in upper halocline and 21 in lower) of phylotypes (43 and 42, respectively,  
390 sharing 99% sequence similarity) in both libraries. Furthermore, only 12 phylotypes  
391 (including 7 ciliate) were shared between the two halocline samples collected only ~1.5  
392 m apart. The different community compositions are likely driven by some combination of  
393 the steep gradient in electron donors and acceptors, salinity, and ammonia concentrations  
394 (5.5  $\mu\text{M}$  in the upper halocline to 3000  $\mu\text{M}$  in the lower). In addition to ciliate signatures  
395 that could not be assigned to any described riboclasses, representatives of  
396 Oligohymenophorea, Spirotrichea and Prostomatea were found in both upper and lower  
397 halocline libraries from L'Atalante, Plagiopylea were found only in the lower,  
398 hypersaline library, and Phyllopharyngea occurred only in the upper halocline (Alexander  
399 et al. 2009).

400 Thetis basin has one of the highest salt concentrations reported for DHABs  
401 (348‰), its brine is 80% halite and 12% bischofite (La Cono et al. 2011), yet it supports  
402 protist counts of ca.  $0.6 \times 10^4$  per liter of anoxic brine (Stock et al. 2012). This RNA-  
403 based study revealed that ciliates accounted for 20% of phylotypes, many of which were  
404 closely related to sequences detected in surveys of other DHABs, suggesting specific  
405 adaptations to these deep, hypersaline habitats. Ciliate signatures in the  
406 oxycline/halocline were dominated by those affiliating with the scuticociliate  
407 *Pleuronema coronatum*. This facultative anaerobe (Fenchel and Bernard 1996) taxon was  
408 also detected in the brine, although at a lower abundance, suggesting this is a halotolerant  
409 (not halophilic) taxon (Stock et al. 2012). Similar sequences were also found in the  
410 interfaces of bischofite ( $\text{MgCl}_2$ ) dominated Discovery Basin and thalassohaline

411 L'Atalante (Alexander et al. 2009; Edgcomb et al. 2009). In the brine of Thetis,  
412 signatures of the strict anaerobe *Trimyema compressum* were found, although signatures  
413 of this presumably halophilic taxon (also found in Bannock and L'Atalante basins) were  
414 phylogenetically distinct from other known marine forms, suggesting the potential for  
415 allopatric speciation in these relatively isolated brine habitats (Stock et al. 2012). Also  
416 detected in the brine and/or oxycline/halocline of Thetis were relatives of *Strombidium*  
417 and *Cyclidium* (previously described from hypersaline habitats) and *Pseudotontonia* (not  
418 previously described from hypersaline habitats).

419 Further evidence for the uniqueness of protist communities in different DHABs  
420 came from a comparison of ciliate communities in the brines and haloclines of four  
421 different DHABs based on SSU rDNA pyrotag analysis (Stock et al. 2013). The interface  
422 communities from Urania, Medee, Thetis, and Tyro basins were relatively similar to each  
423 other, however there were significant differences in the brine ciliate communities from  
424 each site. This suggests that there is some connectivity between the halocline  
425 communities (via mixing with overlying seawater) but little between brine communities,  
426 creating an 'island character' of those habitats and allowing for evolution of unique  
427 assemblages. All four of these basins have thalassohaline brines, however important  
428 distinctions in ionic compositions include that Medee, Tyro, Thetis, and Urania brines  
429 have 792, 71, 604, and 315 mM  $Mg^{2+}$ , respectively, and Urania has 15 mM sulfide as  
430 opposed to 2.1-2.9mM in the other basins (Stock et al. 2013). The brine of Medee was  
431 dominated almost entirely (~89%) by relatives of the genus *Anoplophyra* (Astomatida),  
432 whereas the brines of Tyro and Thetis were similar, but dominated (45% and 65%) by  
433 relatives of *Strombidium* and *Novistrombidium* (30% in Tyro and 9% in Thetis brine). A  
434 few taxa were found only in one of the two basins, such as *Laboea* (in Thetis brine only),  
435 and a tintinnid ciliate taxon *Salpingella* (in Tyro brine only). In Urania, *Pseudotontonia*-  
436 related amplicons dominated (40%). A metadata-analysis found salt and oxygen to be the  
437 largest contributing environmental factors driving differentiation of ciliate communities  
438 (Forster et al. 2012), so it is not surprising that different salt ion concentrations in  
439 different basins would impose different physiological challenges that would select for  
440 unique communities. As Stock et al. (2013) discuss, the degree to which differences in  
441 ciliate communities are shaped by top-down or bottom-up factors, or by differences in  
442 initial 'seed' communities, remains to be determined.

443 It is difficult based on DNA- or RNA-based markers to prove that signatures  
444 represent active/living cells. Scanning electron microscopy was therefore instrumental in  
445 demonstrating the presence of intact and presumably living ciliates in several of these  
446 DHAB brine and halocline habitats (Orsi et al. 2012b; Stock et al. 2013). The dominant  
447 ciliate morphotype present on filters prepared from Discovery Basin halocline samples  
448 (>50% of total protists observed) was a narrowly fusiform ciliate present at a  
449 concentration of  $\sim 3.7 \times 10^5$  cells  $L^{-1}$  and >80% of these cells had 10-20  $\mu m$ -long, slightly  
450 curved bacterial cells attached to their cortex (Orsi et al. 2012b) (Figure 4a). The  
451 observation of these attached, organized arrangements of epibiotic prokaryotes supported  
452 the notion that these ciliates were living. Fluorescence *in situ* hybridization (FISH)  
453 confirmed that these epibionts were deltaproteobacteria (Orsi et al. 2012b). The reduction  
454 of the oral cavity of this ciliate morphotype suggests that this taxon may rely less on  
455 heterotrophic grazing, and more on their putative symbionts for nutrition (Orsi et al.  
456 2012b). Such nutritional symbioses have been observed in other ciliates, such as the

457 karyorelictid ciliate *Kentrophoros fistulosus*, which is dependent on its sulfate-reducing  
458 bacteria (Gast et al. 2009). In contrast to the fusiform ciliates observed in Discovery basin  
459 halocline samples, 95% of all ciliate morphotypes observed in Urania basin  
460 oxycline/halocline samples (and >50% of total eukaryotic cells) were similar to the  
461 scuticociliate morphotype observed in Cariaco anoxic waters, were covered with similar  
462 epibionts, and were present at a concentration of  $\sim 9.7 \times 10^4 \text{ L}^{-1}$  (Orsi et al. 2012b) (Figure  
463 4b). The identity of these epibionts is still unknown beyond their hybridization to general  
464 bacterial FISH probes.

465

## 466 **Looking Forward**

467

468 Steep chemoclines along the stable oxyclines discussed in this paper, with their  
469 gradients in available electron donors and acceptors, likely select for different ciliate  
470 communities and for types of symbioses among ciliates. Similarly, the community  
471 structures of the “deep” water anoxic bodies appear to be shaped by the yet not fully  
472 understood local physicochemical and biotic characteristics of each anoxic water entity,  
473 e.g. hydrogen sulfide is widely known to be toxic to eukaryotes, and hence is a strong  
474 selective force. On the other hand, common ciliate populations are observed in deep  
475 oxyclines and anoxic waters and shallow fjord oxyclines and anoxic waters, which are in  
476 relative close proximity to the photic zone. In spite of the difficulties in making direct  
477 comparisons between the protist communities in the different locations, given the limited  
478 number of samples in some of these studies and physicochemical differences between  
479 them, a common observation is that all these oxycline habitats are inhabited by ciliates,  
480 and that ciliate communities in most cases have distinct compositions of the dominant  
481 taxa. Molecular and/or microscopical approaches have detected ciliates related to  
482 *Cyclidium Strobidium*, *Euplotes* and *Prorodon* in all of the above mentioned sites; for  
483 studies that include abundance data the first two appear to be among the most dominant  
484 taxa within ciliates. Taxa related to *Metopus*, *Mesodinium/Myrionecta*, *Cardiostomatella*  
485 and *Pleuronema* were also detected in most of the sites, and have also been found in a  
486 variety of anoxic environments usually in putative symbiotic association with prokaryotes.  
487 Others, such as *Cariacothrix*, were only detected in one study.

488

489 Syntrophy with bacteria and archaea appears to a dominant strategy among  
490 ciliates living along oxyclines and in anoxic water columns, who likely cooperate in  
491 catabolism of organic matter. This is consistent with what is known of prokaryotic  
492 syntrophies in water column and sedimentary anoxic habitats, including studies of protist-  
493 prokaryote interactions (see detailed discussions in Fenchel and Finlay 1995 and  
494 Hackstein 2011; 2010). Further exploration of the frequently observed putative  
495 symbioses between ciliates and prokaryotes along oxycline water samples and in anoxic  
496 waters will shed light on their role in marine biogeochemical cycling. While the  
497 symbionts of many free-living ciliates in anoxic marine habitats are known to be  
498 methanogens living in close association with host hydrogenosomes, and suggestive of a  
499 cooperative metabolism centered around hydrogen transfer (e.g. Fenchel and Finlay,  
500 1991; van Hoek et al. 2000; Embley and Finlay, 1993; 1994), other types of associates  
501 and metabolic exchanges are also likely.

501

502 Seasonal variation of the ciliate communities in permanently anoxic marine water  
bodies was not expected but, interestingly, it appears to be significant (Behnke et al. 2010,

503 Edgcomb et al 2011). This may result from seasonal changes in organic matter inputs to  
504 deeper, anoxic waters. Further studies of seasonal changes in the ciliate inhabitants of the  
505 permanent anoxic marine water bodies that show no or little variation in the  
506 physicochemical conditions, would give exciting insights in the drivers succession of  
507 abundant taxa. Seasonal studies of such communities together with their prokaryotic  
508 associations have not yet been performed, and these would further elucidate if biotic  
509 factors can shape anoxic ciliate assemblages, or perhaps, how such associations can shape  
510 the environment through their microbial transformations.

511

512

### 513 **Acknowledgments**

514

515 Edgcomb's Cariaco work was a collaboration with G. Taylor (Stony Brook U.) and S.  
516 Epstein (Northeastern U.) (MCB-0348407 to VE), her DHAB work was a collaboration  
517 with J.M. Bernhard (WHOI), K. Kormas (U. Thessaly), M. Yakimov (CNRS), and T.  
518 Stoeck (U. Kaiserslautern) (NSF OCE-0849578 to VE and JMB).

519

### 520 **References**

521

- 522 Alexander, E., Stock, A., Breiner, H.W., Behnke, A., Bunge, J., Yakimov, M.M., &  
523 Stoeck, T. 2009. Microbial eukaryotes in the hypersaline anoxic L'Atalante deep-sea  
524 basin. *Environ. Microbiol.* 11:360–381.
- 525 Anderson, R., Wylezich, C., Glaubitz, S., Labrenz, M., & Jurgens, K. 2013. Impact of  
526 protist grazing on a key bacterial group for biogeochemical cycling in Baltic Sea  
527 pelagic oxic/anoxic interfaces. *Environ Microbiol* 15:1580-1594.
- 528 Anderson, R., Winter, C., & Jurgens, K. 2012. Protist grazing and viral lysis as  
529 prokaryotic mortality factors at Baltic Sea oxic-anoxic interfaces. *Mar Ecol Prog*  
530 *Ser* 467:1-14.
- 531 Arístegui J., Gasol, J.M., Duarte, C.M., & Herndl, G.J. 2009. Microbial oceanography of  
532 the dark ocean's pelagic realm. *Limnol & Oceanogr* 54:1501-1529.
- 533 Baumgartner, M., Stetter, K.O., & Foissner, W. 2002. Morphological, small subunit  
534 rRNA, and physiological characterization of *Trimyema minutum* (Kahl, 1931), an  
535 anaerobic ciliate from submarine hydrothermal vents growing from 28°C to 52°C. *J*  
536 *Eukaryot Microbiol* 49:227–238
- 537 Behnke, A., Bunge, J., Barger, K., Breiner, H.W., Alla, V., & Stoeck, T. 2006.  
538 Microeukaryote community patterns along an O<sub>2</sub>/H<sub>2</sub>S gradient in a supersulfidic  
539 anoxic fjord (Framvaren, Norway). *Appl Environ Microbiol* 72: 3626–3636.
- 540 Behnke, A., Barger, K.J., Bunge, J., & Stoeck, T. 2010. Spatio-temporal variations in  
541 protistan communities along an O<sub>2</sub>/H<sub>2</sub>S gradient in the anoxic Framvaren Fjord  
542 (Norway). *FEMS Microbiol Ecol* 72: 89–102.

- 543 Brock, T.D., Madigan, M.T., & Martinko, J.M. 1994. *Biology of Microorganisms*, 7th  
544 ed.; Benjamin Cummings: San Francisco, CA, USA, p. 909.
- 545 Cita, M.B. 2006. Exhumation of Messinian evaporites in the deep-sea and creation of  
546 deep anoxic brine filled collapsed basins. *Sedimentary Geology* 188-189:357-378.
- 547 Clarke, K.J., Finlay, B.J., Esteban, G., Guhl, B.E., & Embley, T.M. (1993) *Cyclidium*  
548 *porcatum* n. sp.: free-living anaerobic scuticociliate containing a stable complex of  
549 hydrogenosomes, Eubacteria and Archaeobacteria. *Eur J Protistol* 29:262–270.
- 550 Coolen, M.J., & Shtereva, G. 2009. Vertical distribution of metabolically active  
551 eukaryotes in the water column and sediments of the Black Sea. *FEMS Microbiol*  
552 *Ecol* 70:525–539.
- 553 Corliss, J.O. 1979. *The Ciliated Protozoa*. Pergamon Press, Oxford.
- 554 Diaz, R.J., Rosenberg, R. 2008. Spreading dead zones and consequences for marine  
555 ecosystems. *Science* 321:926-929.
- 556 Detmer, A.E., Giesenhausen, H.C., Trenkel, V.M., Auf Dem Venne, H., & Jochem, F.J.  
557 1993. Phototrophic and heterotrophic pico- and nanoplankton in anoxic depths of  
558 the central Baltic Sea. *Mar Ecol Prog Ser* 99:197-203.
- 559 Dyer, B.D. 1989. *Metopus*, *Cyclidium* and *Sonderia*: ciliates enriched and cultured from  
560 sulfureta of a microbial mat community. *Biosystems* 23:41-51.
- 561 Edgcomb, V.P., Orsi, W. 2013. Microbial eukaryotes in hypersaline anoxic deep sea  
562 basins. In: Seckbach, J., Oren, A., and Stan-Lotter, H. (eds.), *COLE Series:*  
563 *Polyextremophiles – Life Under Multiple Forms of Stress, Cellular Origin, Life in*  
564 *Extreme Habitats and Astrobiology*, Vol. 27, Springer Verlag, 634pp.
- 565 Edgcomb, V., Orsi, W., Leslin, C., Epstein, S.S., Bunge, J., Jeon, S., Yakimov, M.M.,  
566 Behnke, A., & Stoeck, T. 2009. Protistan community patterns within the brine and  
567 halocline of deep hypersaline anoxic basins in the eastern Mediterranean Sea.  
568 *Extremophiles*, 13:151–167.
- 569 Edgcomb, V.P., Orsi, W., Bunge, J., Jeon, S.-O., Christen, R., Leslin, C., Holder, M.,  
570 Taylor, G.T., Suarez, P., Varela, R., & Epstein, S. 2011. Protistan microbial  
571 observatory in the Cariaco Basin, Caribbean. I. Pyrosequencing vs. Sanger insights  
572 into species richness. *ISME J* 5:1344-1356.
- 573 Embley, T.M., & Finlay, B.J. 1993. "Systematic and morphological diversity of  
574 endosymbiotic methanogens in anaerobic ciliates." *Antonie van Leeuwenhoek* 64(3-  
575 4): 261-271.
- 576 Embley, T.M., & Finlay, B.J. 1994. "The use of small subunit rRNA sequences to  
577 unravel the relationships between anaerobic ciliates and their methanogen  
578 endosymbionts." *Microbiology* 140:225-235.
- 579 Fenchel, T. 1987. *Ecology of Protozoa*. Springer: Berlin.
- 580 Fenchel, T., & Bernard, C. 1996. Behavioural responses in oxygen gradients of ciliates

- 581 from microbial mats. *Europ J Protistol* 32:55-63.
- 582 Fenchel, T., & Finlay, B.J. 1990. Anaerobic free-living protozoa—growth efficiencies  
583 and the structure of anaerobic communities. *FEMS Microbiol Ecol* 74:269–275
- 584 Fenchel, T., & Finlay, B.J. 1991. The biology of free-living anaerobic ciliates. *Europ J*  
585 *Protistol* 26:201-215.
- 586 Fenchel, T., & Finlay, B.J. 1995. *Ecology and Evolution in Anoxic Worlds*, Oxford Series  
587 in Ecology and Evolution, R.M. May and P.H. Harvey, Eds, Oxford University  
588 Press, New York, 276 pp.
- 589 Fenchel, T., & Finlay, B.J. 2006. The diversity of microbes: resurgence of the phenotype.  
590 *Philos Trans R Soc Lond B* 361:1965–1973.
- 591 Fenchel, T., Kristensen, L.D. & Rasmussen, L. 1990. Water column anoxia: vertical  
592 zonation of planctonic protozoa. *Mar Ecol Prog Ser* 62: 1–10.
- 593 Forster, D., Behnke, A., & Stoeck, T. 2012. Meta-analyses of environmental sequence  
594 data identify anoxia and salinity as parameters shaping ciliate communities.  
595 *Systematics and Biodiversity* 10(3):277–288.
- 596 Frias-Lopez, J., Thompson, A., Waldbauer, J., & Chisholm, S. W., 2009. Use of stable  
597 isotope-labelled cells to identify active grazers of picocyanobacteria in ocean  
598 surface waters. *Env. Microbiol.* 11:512-525.
- 599 Gast, R.J., Sanders, R.W., & Caron, D.A. 2009. Ecological strategies of protists and their  
600 symbiotic relationships with prokaryotic microbes. *Trends Microbiol.* 17: 563-9.
- 601 Gong, J., Dong, J., Liu, X., & Massana, R. 2013. Extremely high copy numbers and  
602 polymorphisms of the rDNA operon estimated from single cell analysis of oligotrich  
603 and peritrich ciliates. *Protist* 164:369-379.
- 604 Guggiari, M., & Peck, R. 2008. The bacterivorous ciliate *Cyclidium glaucoma* isolated  
605 from a sewage treatment plant: molecular and cytological descriptions for  
606 barcoding. *Eur J Protistol* 44: 168–180.
- 607 Guhl, B.E., Finlay, B.J., & Schink, B. 1996. Comparison of ciliate communities in the  
608 anoxic hypolimnia of three lakes: general features and the influence of lake  
609 characteristics. *J Plankton Res* 18: 335–353.
- 610 Hackstein, J.H.P. 2011. "Anaerobic Ciliates and Their Methanogenic Endosymbionts."  
611 *Microbiol Monographs* 19:12-23.
- 612 Hackstein, J.H.P. 2010. *(Endo)symbiotic Methanogenic Archaea, Microbiology*  
613 *Monographs*, A. Steinbüchel, Ser. Ed., Springer, New York, 237 pp.
- 614 Jørgensen, B.B., Fossing, H., Wirsén, C.O. & Jannach, H.W. (1991). Sulfide oxidation in  
615 the anoxic Black Sea chemocline. *Deep-Sea Res* 38: 1083–1103
- 616 La Cono V, Smedile F, Bortoluzzi G., Arcadi, E., Maimone, G., Messina, E., Borghini,  
617 M., Oliveri, E., Mazolla, S., L'Haridon, S., Toffin, L., Genovese, L., Ferrer, M.,  
618 Giuliano, L., Golyshin, P.N., & Yakimov, M.M. 2011. Unveiling microbial life of

- 619 new deep-sea hypersaline lake Thetis. Prokaryotes and environmental settings. *Env*  
620 *Microbiol* doi:10.1111/j.1462-2920.2011.02478.x
- 621 Lin, X.J., Scranton, M.I., Chistoserdov, A., Varela, R., & Taylor, G.T. 2008.  
622 Spatiotemporal dynamics of bacterial populations in the anoxic Cariaco Basin.  
623 *Limnol Oceanogr* 53:37-51.
- 624 Lin, X., Scranton, M.I., Varela, R., Chistoserdov, A., & Taylor, G.T. 2007. Compositional  
625 responses of bacterial communities to redox gradients and grazing in the anoxic  
626 Cariaco Basin. *Aquat Microb Ecol* 47:57-72.
- 627 Litchfield, C.D. 1998. Survival strategies for microorganisms in hypersaline  
628 environments and their relevance to life on early Mars. *Planet Sci.* 33: 813–819.
- 629 Lopez-Garcia, P., Rodriguez-Valera, F., Pedros-Alio, C., & Moreira, D. 2001.  
630 Unexpected diversity of small eukaryotes in deep-sea Antarctic plankton. *Nature*:  
631 409:603-607.
- 632 Lynn, D. 2008. *The ciliated protozoa: characterization, classification, and guide to the*  
633 *literature*, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition, Springer, New York.
- 634 Millero, F.J. 1991. The oxidation of H<sub>2</sub>S in Framvaren Fjord. *Limnol Oceanogr* 36:1007–  
635 1014.
- 636 Moon-van der Staay, S.Y., De Wachter, R., & Vaultot, D. 2001. Oceanic 18S rDNA  
637 sequences from picoplankton reveal unsuspected eukaryotic diversity. *Nature* 409:  
638 607-610.
- 639 Murray, J.W. & Yala-del-Rio, H.L. 2006. The suboxic transition zone in the Black Sea.  
640 Past and Present Marine Water Column Anoxia, *NATO Science Series: IV – Earth*  
641 *and Environmental Sciences* (Neretin LN, ed), pp. 105–138. Springer Verlag,  
642 Dordrecht.
- 643 Orsi, W., Edgcomb, V.P., Jeon, S.O., Leslin, C., Bunge, J., Taylor, G.T., Varela, R., &  
644 Epstein, S. 2011. Protistan microbial observatory in the Cariaco Basin, Caribbean.  
645 II. Habitat specialization. *ISME J* 5:1357-1373.
- 646 Orsi, W., Edgcomb, V.P., Faria, J., Foissner, W., Fowle, W.H., Hohnmann, T., Suarez,  
647 P., Taylor, C., Taylor, G.T., Vd'acny, P., & Epstein, S. 2012. Class Cariacotrichea,  
648 a novel ciliate taxon from the anoxic Cariaco Basin, Venezuela. *The International*  
649 *Journal of Systematic and Evolutionary Microbiology* doi:10.1099/ij.s.0.034710-0.
- 650 Orsi, W., S. Charvet, J. Bernhard, & Edgcomb, V.P. 2012b. Prevalence of partnerships  
651 between bacteria and ciliates in oxygen-depleted marine water columns. *Frontiers*  
652 *in Extreme Microbiol.* 3:341. doi: 10.3389/fmicb.2012.00341.
- 653 Orsi, W., Y.C. Song, S. Hallam, & Edgcomb, V.P. 2012c. Effect of oxygen minimum  
654 zone formation on communities of marine protists. *ISME Journal*, doi:  
655 10.1038/ismej.2012.7.

- 656 Pedros-Alio, C. 2006. Marine microbial diversity: can it be determined? *Trends*  
657 *Microbiol* 14: 257–263.
- 658 Pedros-Alio, C. 2007. Dipping into the rare biosphere. *Science* 315:192–193.
- 659 Peterson, L. C., Haug, G. H., Hughen, K. A., & Rohl, U. 2000. Rapid changes in the  
660 hydrologic cycle of the tropical Atlantic during the last glacial. *Science*, 290:1947–  
661 1951.
- 662 Post, F.J., Borowitzka, L.J., Borowitzka, M.A., Mackay, B. & Moulton, T. 1983. The  
663 protozoa of a Western Australian hypersaline lagoon. *Hydrobiologia*, 105:95–113.
- 664 Robertson, P., & Burke, K. 1989. Evolution of southern Caribbean Plate boundary,  
665 vicinity of Trinidad and Tobago. *AAPG Bulletin* 73:490-509.
- 666 Schopf, J.W., & Klein, C. 1992. The Proterozoic Biosphere: A Multidisciplinary Study.  
667 Cambridge University Press, New York.
- 668 Sherr, E.B., & Sherr, B.F. 1994. Bacterivory and herbivory: key roles of phagotrophic  
669 protists in pelagic food webs. *Microb Ecol* 28:223–235.
- 670 Sherr, E., & Sherr, B. 2002. Significance of predation by protists in aquatic microbial  
671 food webs. *Antonie van Leeuwenhoek* 81:293-308.
- 672 Sorokin, Y.I. 1972. The bacterial population and the processes of hydrogen sulphide  
673 oxidation in the Black Sea. *J Cons Int Explor Mer* 34:423–454.
- 674 Stock, A., Breiner, H.-W., Pachiadaki, M., Edgcomb, V., Filker, S., LaCono, V.,  
675 Yakimov, M.M., & Stoeck, T. 2012. Microbial eukaryote life in the new hypersaline  
676 deep-sea basin Thetis. *Extremophiles*, 16:21–34.
- 677 Stock, A., Edgcomb, V., Orsi, W., Filker, S., Breiner, H.-W., Yakimov, M.M., & Stoeck,  
678 T. 2013. Evidence for isolated evolution of deep-sea ciliate communities through  
679 geological separation and environmental selection. *BMC Microbiol* 13:150.
- 680 Stock, A., Jürgens, K., Bunge, J., & Stoeck, T. 2009. Protistan diversity in suboxic and  
681 anoxic waters of the Gotland Deep (Baltic Sea) as revealed by 18S rRNA clone  
682 libraries. *Aquat Microb Ecol* 55: 267–284.
- 683 Stoeck, T., & Epstein, S. 2003. Novel eukaryotic lineages inferred from small-subunit  
684 rRNA analyses of oxygen-depleted marine environments. *Appl Environ Microbiol*  
685 69:2657–2663.
- 686 Stoeck, T., Foissner, W., & Lynn, D.H. 2007. Small-subunit rRNA phylogenies suggest  
687 that *Epalxella antiquorum* (Penard, 1922) Corliss, 1960 (Ciliophora,  
688 Odontostomatida) is a member of the Plagyiopylea. *J Eukaryot Microbiol* 54:436–  
689 442
- 690 Stoeck, T., Hayward, B., Taylor, G.T., Varela, R., & Epstein, S.S. 2006. A multiple PCR-  
691 primer approach to access the microeukaryotic diversity in environmental samples.  
692 *Protist* 157:31–43.

- 693 Stoeck, T., Taylor, G.T., & Epstein, S. 2003. Novel eukaryotes from the permanently  
694 anoxic Cariaco Basin (Caribbean Sea). *Appl Environ Microbiol*, 69:5656–5663.
- 695 Suttle, C.A. 2005. Viruses in the sea. *Nature* 437:356-361.
- 696 Taylor, G.T., Karl, D.M., & Pace, M.L. 1986. Impact of bacteria and zooflagellates on  
697 the composition of sinking particles: An *in situ* experiment. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.*  
698 29: 141-155.
- 699 Taylor, G., Scranton, M., Iabichella, M., Ho, T.Y., & Varela, R. 2001. Chemoautotrophy  
700 in the redox transition zone of the Cariaco Basin, a significant source of midwater  
701 organic carbon production. *Limnol Oceanogr* 46:148-163.
- 702 Tuttle, J.H., & Jannasch, H.W. 1973. Sulfide and thiosulfate-oxidizing bacteria in anoxic  
703 marine basins. *Mar Biol* 9:64–70. doi: 10.1007/BF00387676.
- 704 Tuttle, J.H., & Jannasch, H.W. 1979. Microbial dark assimilation of CO<sub>2</sub> in the Cariaco  
705 Trench, *Limnol Oceanogr* 24:746-753.
- 706 Van der Wielen, P.W.; Bolhuis, H.; Borin, S.; Daffonchio, D.; Corselli, C.; Giuliano, L.;  
707 D’Auria, G.; de Lange, G.J.; Huebner, A.; Varnavas, S.P.; Thomson, J., Tamburini,  
708 C., Marty, D., McGenity, T.J., Timmis, K.N., & BioDeep Scientific Party. 2005.  
709 The enigma of prokaryotic life in deep hypersaline anoxic basins. *Science* 307:121–  
710 123.
- 711 van Hoek, A.H., van Alen, T.A., Sprakel, V.S., Leunissen, J.A., Brigge, T., Vogels, G.D.,  
712 & Hackstein, J.H. 2000. Multiple acquisition of methanogenic archaeal symbionts  
713 by anaerobic ciliates. *Mol Biol Evol* 17:251-8.
- 714 Wright, A.D., & Colomi, A. 2002. Taxonomic assignment of *Cryptocaryon irritans*, a  
715 marine fish parasite. *Europ J Protistol* 37:375-378.
- 716 Wylezich C, & Jurgens K: 2011 Protist diversity in suboxic and sulfidic waters of the  
717 Black Sea. *Environ Microbiol* 13(11):2939-2956.
- 718 Yildiz, I., & Senler, G. 2013. *Frontonia anatolica* n. sp., a new peniculid ciliate (Protista,  
719 Ciliophora) from Lake Van, Turkey. *Turkish J Zool* 37:24-30.
- 720 Zuendorf, A., Bunge, J., Behnke, A., Barger, K.J.A., & Stoeck, T. 2006. Diversity  
721 estimates of microeukaryotes below the chemocline of the anoxic Mariager Fjord,  
722 Denmark. *FEMS Microbiol Ecol* 58:476–491.
- 723 Zubkov, M.V., Sazhin, A.F., & Flint, M.V. 1992. The microplankton organisms at the  
724 oxic-anoxic interface in the pelagial of the Black Sea. *FEMS Microbiol Ecol* 101:  
725 245–250.
- 726
- 727

728 **Table and Figure Legends**

729

730 **Table 1.** Signatures of ciliate taxa recovered in studies of Cariaco Basin, Black Sea,  
731 DHABs, Framvaren Fjord, and Mariager Fjord oxycline and anoxic waters.

732 n.d.=not detectable, n.r.=not reported

733 <sup>§</sup> 6 monthly samplings, oxycline ranged from ~11-23 m in April to ~13-17m in October  
734 and anoxic layer from ~23-25 to ~17-25m

735 <sup>#</sup> cannot be converted in  $\mu\text{M}$  due to the lack of temperature data

736 Type of data M=microscopy counts, D=SSU rDNA, R=SSU rRNA; \*Abundance (of  
737 signatures or cells) data provided in source study.

738 +=present, ++=present and noted in study as relatively abundant.

739

740 **Table 2.** Physicochemical data for several Eastern Mediterranean Sea DHABs illustrating  
741 variations in hydrochemistry. <sup>1</sup>Using the conventional sensor mounted on CTD rosette,  
742 the measurement of conductivity is not reliable in athalassohaline brines enriched by  
743 divalent cations.

744

745 **Figure 1.** Map of Cariaco Basin, Venezuela. Stars indicate positions of sampling stations.  
746 Adapted from Edgcomb et al. 2011.

747

748 **Figure 2.** Image of the deep hypersaline anoxic basin Discovery. Top of  
749 oxycline/halocline in vicinity of light ‘beach,’ and dark brine to the right. Image taken  
750 with ROV *Jason*.

751

752 **Figure 3.** Scanning electron micrographs of scuticociliates with different epibiotic  
753 bacteria recovered from the Cariaco Basin (a-c) (Caribbean Sea) B: Bacteria, Scale bar in  
754 a applies to b: 9  $\mu\text{m}$ , Images a-b are modified from Orsi et al., 2012b. Photographs by W.  
755 Orsi.

756

757 **Figure 4.** Scanning electron micrographs of ciliates with different epibiotic bacteria  
758 recovered from Urania and Discovery basins (Eastern Mediterranean Sea); a) ~9 $\mu\text{m}$  long  
759 scuticociliate morphotype from Urania Basin (adapted from Edgcomb and Orsi 2013); b)  
760 fusiform ciliate from Discovery Basin halocline (adapted from Orsi et al. 2012b) scale  
761 bar 5  $\mu\text{m}$ . Photographs by W. Orsi.